Evidence from research and development work in Bradford

Round-up
Reviewing the evidence

October 2009

Since 2004, the Joseph Rowntree Foundation has been committed to a ten-year programme to improve life in Bradford, where people of different ethnicities, religions and cultures face common challenges of poverty, disempowerment, social and economic division and the impact of recession.

This paper:

- summarises findings from eight research projects about Muslim women, Pakistani Muslim young men, recent migrants to Bradford and life on former council estates.

Key points

- Poverty and social and economic division are clear challenges in Bradford. National policies can work against rather than with real local experience. Finding connections between disadvantaged groups could provide a stronger foundation for social cohesion.
- Policies for 'preventing violent extremism' pose difficulties for valued projects such as the West Bowling Youth Initiative. Policy-makers need sensitive conversations with those involved in local community work to address the counter-productive and stigmatising effects that such policies are having on the ground.
- Migrants to Bradford without support networks experience isolation. Early intervention is needed to help new migrants to settle, particularly where anti-social behaviour is a problem.
- Residents on 'traditionally white' former council estates in Bradford feel disempowered, but recognise that the issues they face are society-wide. Tensions exist between old and young, and relationships with professional agencies are poor.
- Muslim women in Bradford want to live full lives, and challenge oppression and exclusion. Growing numbers are motivated to work for local, national and international change.
- Long-term commitment to a place and its people is vital for trust to develop. There is a clear place for funding single-ethnicity organisations. Formal, literacy-based communication between agencies and residents often fails. Face-to-face relationships and continuity are important.
- Arts programmes can create imaginative solutions and change perceptions. Many of the Bradford projects used creative media for their research and to communicate their findings.

Author
Professor Richard Farnell, Coventry University

JOSEPH ROWNTREE FOUNDATION

www.jrf.org.uk

Introduction

Since 2004, the Joseph Rowntree Foundation (JRF) has been committed to a ten-year programme to make a positive contribution to life in Bradford, through networking and a research and development programme. The first phase (*Communities Bradford*) is complete. Eight projects were supported to work with local people. Seven of the projects used creative media for their activities, as research tools or to communicate their findings. They provided opportunities for hundreds of people to face challenges and improve their sense of personal and community well-being.

Although this programme involved Bradford residents, general conclusions can be drawn. The overall message is that there is a large degree of commonality in the lives and experiences of those with different ethnicities, religions and cultures. Purposeful activity, decent earnings, finding appropriate housing, feeling safe in the neighbourhood and entertaining hope for family and the future are important to everyone.

This paper calls for more recognition and promotion of these common life experiences as one approach to challenging suspicion among people of different backgrounds. An alternative narrative is needed which focuses on issues of poverty, inequality and powerlessness. Such a 'narrative in common' has the potential to unite the residents of social housing estates and inner cities, regardless of ethnic origin, class, culture or religion. There is some evidence of this developing in Bradford already.

A 'narrative in common' – developed by local people and connecting them across different neighbourhoods and backgrounds – could provide a more natural and progressive idea of 'cohesion' than that promoted through national policy and performance indicators. Across the JRF programme, 'key informants' in positions of authority (statutory and voluntary sectors) were highly critical of what they saw as the counter-productive, stigmatising and divisive effects of the Government's inter-linking between 'cohesion' and 'national security'. This inter-linking runs counter to the experiences of local agencies and Bradford's diverse population.

Alongside shared experiences of disempowerment and disadvantage, the striking message from across the projects is that of pride in Bradford and district, of dignity and activism. While the films and projects present the harsh realities of social and economic divides in the city – recognisable in many other parts of the UK too – they also capture a strong sense of belonging and hope for Bradford's future.

Background

In the mid-nineteenth century, the industrialist and politician Titus Salt invested in textiles, housing and civic development in Bradford. The textile industry came to be identified with the city and sub-region. The industry flourished and drew in labour, initially from the surrounding hills and subsequently from the whole of the UK and abroad. Recruitment of people from South Asia, especially Pakistan, was well underway 50 years ago, filling jobs in Bradford and Keighley's woollen mills.

This was the migration that became associated in the national mind with Bradford, seen as a city of Pakistani Muslim immigration. The image became more pronounced over the years as the textile industry declined and reputations were created following unease, tensions and street violence in 1995 and 2001. Add to this the impact of the local response to Salman Rushdie's *Satanic verses*, the conflicts in Iraq, the Middle East and Darfur and the aftermath of 9/11 and 7/7, and stereotypical Bradford was created.

These images of Bradford, like all stereotypes, are both partial and misleading. As with many conurbations of Bradford's population – the fifth largest in the UK – its geography and social structure are varied. Within its boundaries Bradford has probably the largest areas of countryside of any metropolitan district. Ilkley and Shipley are wealthy towns within the district from which commuters travel over West Yorkshire and beyond. It boasts a wide range of social and cultural activity, including the National Media Museum (Shafi, 2008).

The Joseph Rowntree Foundation is trying to make a positive difference to the people of Bradford. Using its charitable resources to better understand life in Bradford and contribute to developing practical programmes and projects, JRF wishes to help Bradfordians to respond constructively to the needs and issues they identify. In this first phase, the identified issues were:

- culture makes communities;
- faith and cohesion;
- impact of migration on communities.

Research in Bradford

Bradford has seen many social research projects. Research undertaken between 1995 and 2005 ranged broadly over policy and practice concerns within the city (Darlow *et al.*, 2005). Key features were the issues facing the city's ethnic minorities, the generally low levels of economic activity, and poor educational qualifications. The review of that research by Darlow *et al.* suggested that more emphasis was needed on how people of different ethnicities and faith relate to one another, the experience and views of the majority white population, and the position and role of Muslim women.

More recently, two areas of Bradford-based research have stimulated wide academic and policy interest. The first relates to the events of July 2001 and the violent confrontations in Manningham. The part which British Pakistani Muslim young men played in these riots generated research reflecting the complexity and diversity of views, beliefs and behaviour among these men (Alam and Husband, 2006; Alam, 2007; Lewis, 2007).

A second area of debate and, indeed, dispute concerns the extent of residential segregation in relation to residents' ethnicity and religious background. What is the evidence of segregation, what are the reasons for it, and how might it be changing? And, ultimately, what significance and impact does this have on the life of the city and its communities (Phillips *et al*., 2002; Simpson, 2004; Johnston, *et al*., 2005; Carling, 2008)? The arguments revolve around a desire for greater understanding of why "residential segregation is a significant phenomenon in Bradford, both at Enumeration District level and the ward level" (Carling, 2008, p.563).

These issues and research interests provided the context for considering and selecting the proposals for JRF support. The eight selected projects targeted the following topics:

- increasing levels of community participation in health promotion programmes through use of the creative arts (*Engage*);
- capturing best practice and influencing policy on promoting engagement between young men of British Pakistani Muslim background (*Lessons from the West Bowling Youth Initiative)*;
- using live performance and participatory film-making to promote understanding between different communities in Keighley (*Keighley now*);
- understanding the experience of new migrants living in a predominantly white social housing estate (*Holme Wood development project*);

- working with Muslim women to articulate their experience of life through the use of digital media, especially film (*Women working towards excellence: OurLives project*);

- facilitating and evaluating the engagement of women across faith communities to tackle social exclusion and contribute to social cohesion in Bradford (*Women, faith and social cohesion*);

- identifying the causes of tension between new and settled migrants in Bradford, and finding ways of strengthening community cohesion in relation to migrants from Central and Eastern Europe (*Making a new life*);

- using community activists to generate critical self-awareness among research participants and estate residents about space, poverty and cohesion (*Participation and community on Bradford's 'traditionally white' estates*).

Many projects used creative media such as photography, film-making, drama and craftwork to pursue their objectives. Activities encouraged creative talents to help personal development, community cohesion and healthy living. Project outputs provided learning about the experiences and perceptions of four groups of Bradford residents:

- the mindsets and aspirations of Muslim women;

- the mentoring of British Pakistani Muslim young men through their teens and early twenties;

- the experience of recent migrants to the city;

- the attitude of people on traditionally 'white' estates to life in their community.

The remainder of this paper summarises the learning from each of these groups in relation to Bradford and, where appropriate, to research and development findings from elsewhere. It also looks at the value of using creative media in such projects.

The wealth of evidence from the *Communities Bradford* programme deserves a national hearing as well as being circulated locally: it resonates loudly with experiences in other parts of the UK (including areas which are less or more diverse than Bradford). The findings challenge negative stereotypes, not only of particular groups, but of Bradford and its people more generally.

Muslim women and their aspirations

> I jumped at the chance to voice my opinions because I have a lot to say. I didn't think that it would be such an emotional process though; thinking about my children's future, the men in my life, the Muslim community, what I witnessed happening around the world and their implications. It helped having someone I trusted, and being assured about confidentiality because some of the things I really would not want anybody to know about.
> (Project participant; Shaffi, 2008)

Challenging stereotypes

Muslim women were the focus of two of the Bradford projects. One used digital media to explore their lives and aspirations. The other enabled women from Muslim and other faith communities to meet, work together and understand each other at a deeper level.

The *Women working towards excellence: OurLives* project has provided rich insights into the thinking and aspirations of Muslim women in Bradford. It aimed to challenge the stereotypes and myths that inhabit the media and the public sphere. By capturing Muslim women's experiences and stories it has presented their breadth of perspective and engagement with their families, communities and the wider context of life in West Yorkshire and beyond. This was achieved without ignoring issues faced in some communities regarding family, gender relationships and marriage (Macey, 2008).

Through well-attended 'Inspiring change' seminars on parenting, education, young people, global change and faith in a secular society, a wide net was cast to include women from a broad range of Muslim communities. Twenty women told their stories for publication (Shaffi, 2009), and ten were selected to be the subjects of films exploring their backgrounds, attitudes to life and their futures. Their stories touch on a wide range of issues, including their faith, their own (or parents' or grandparents') experience of migration to Britain, how they see themselves and feel seen by others, and transformational moments in their lives. The women produced and directed the films themselves, with professional help – an experience which added to their skills and confidence.

One of the project's major contributions has been to challenge negative stereotypical views of Muslim women, whose experience of life is as varied and as 'good and bad' as other sections of society.

Indications of change

The women in this project were predominantly, but not exclusively, of Pakistani heritage. Born and educated in the Bradford district, most of them were the children

The films challenged negative stereotypes and assumptions about Muslim women.

and grandchildren of migrants to the city 30 to 50 years ago. Many had been through higher education and were independent in mind and thought. They were teachers, dentists, film-makers, photographers, social workers, doctors, shopkeepers, lecturers, journalists, call centre workers, retail workers, care workers and students.

Such diverse occupations are just one indication of change in Muslim communities. A 2007 workshop of community-based practitioners from Bradford, Oldham and Burnley noted that:

> In recent years Muslim women, particularly younger Muslim women, are becoming more visible and confident in representing their communities in different public arenas. (Pearson, 2007)

Such developments have been recognised elsewhere in the UK. For example, a study of South Asian British women's housing aspirations, working with women from Bradford, Birmingham and Tower Hamlets, found that:

> South Asian women considered their role in the household to be different to their mothers' generation. In contrast, they were more independent, educated, able to speak English and drive, and were wage earners, which all gave them more say in decisions. (Harries *et al*., 2008)

Another study, in Wolverhampton and Birmingham, profiled the testimony of 50 black and minority ethnic women, including those of Asian background, on the 'routes and barriers to citizen governance'. It emphasised the importance of personal interest and background influences like faith, upbringing and life experiences in assessing the factors that motivate engagement. Yet such movement into new arenas was marred by negative stereotyping.

> Muslim women highlighted negative connotations associated with wearing a headscarf and general anti-Islamic prejudice due to perceived links to terrorism. Even highly educated, experienced participants felt underlying pressure to justify their involvement within governance structures. (Rai, 2008)

The life experiences of Muslim women in Bradford are similarly varied and complex. For second- and third-generation British Muslims of Pakistani origin the feeling is that: "the Muslim community is at a critical juncture in the history of Muslim experience in Britain" (Shaffi, forthcoming). There are opportunities to be innovative and develop leadership within and outside their communities of origin. Their identity is multi-dimensional: they are proud of their Islamic faith and Pakistani heritage, but they are also proud to be British, most of the time, and to be natives of Bradford, West Yorkshire.

Strong opinions

Key messages from these women are summarised in the research report (Shaffi, forthcoming):

- All the women had opinions about everything affecting their lives, and more. They had aspirations for themselves and their families, including a desire to succeed, despite the odds.
- Most wanted to live 'contemporary cosmopolitan lifestyles', holidaying, dining out and shopping, like women of other backgrounds and cultures.
- Faith was an important part of their identity, but they wanted friends of different faiths and origins. They wanted to interact with 'other' people and for their children to be able to develop and extend their friendships, in and out of school.
- They saw a diminishing role for the extended family in their lives. Transcontinental marriages were seen as less appealing and forced marriages as un-Islamic, in violation of a woman's right to choose her partner. All placed great importance on marriage, motherhood and having a partner who was supportive and compatible, even if they were difficult to find.
- Finally, they had genuine fears of 'far right groups' and the rise of Islamophobia in Britain, together with strong feelings about Middle East conflicts and some policies of the British government – their government.

Social exclusion and 'bridging' between faith communities

The *Women, faith and social cohesion* project has provided different perspectives on the lives of women in Bradford – women who are more tentative and perhaps less confident of themselves and their place in the city. This was evident as they worked towards interacting with women of different cultures and faiths. The project focused on cohesion and related 'social capital' concepts:

- Bonding capital – people connecting with others from their own or similar backgrounds.
- Bridging capital – people connecting with those from different backgrounds to their own (whether ethnicity, gender, age, religion).
- Linking capital – people (groups, communities) connecting with agencies and those in authority (politicians, local authorities, police).

Following 'key informant' interviews, six cross-faith groups of women planned and implemented self-devised activities. The learning from the project focused on the journeys of around 100 women, as 'key informants', focus group participants or project leaders. The project aimed to facilitate and evaluate the engagement of women across faith communities through such 'bridging' activities.

Acknowledging the 'double' social exclusion experienced by women and especially women of faith, the project made important observations about this 'bridging' work between communities. It worked among women relating to one another informally, in many cases for the first time, rather than through more male-dominated formal religious organisations. Initially, Muslim women were the dominant participants. It proved difficult to recruit women from other faiths, and when this was eventually done it was still problematic to create the environment where women of different faiths could feel at home with each other and commit to work together to common ends. In this particular project, Muslim women were more inclined to engage with those of faiths other than Christianity. Explanations for this are not clear, but it may be because of the relative strength of local partner organisations and their ability to encourage participation.

Barriers to bridging

Asking women to 'bridge' to those of other backgrounds is difficult if they do not have space available even to bond with those of similar backgrounds. The existence of some type of 'formal organisation' seems to make it easier, allowing the confidence to take the initiative and challenge the given circumstances around them. The project recognised that external facilitation also helps significantly in enabling relationships to develop. Facilitation is sometimes needed to give external credibility to a group wishing to take bridging initiatives.

It is often assumed that people of the same faith will, almost by definition, be able to bond with each other. This study confirmed others' findings (Furbey *et al*., 2006) that this is not always the case. Sub-groups within faiths around differences of background, gender, age, culture, practice and interpretation can present considerable challenges to bonding. In such circumstances, "internal bonding, or 're-bonding', is a prerequisite to effective bridging" (Mir, forthcoming).

As was also evident in the *Our Lives* project, religious beliefs were an important component of identity for these women and a powerful motivator. Yet that is not the full story. Some women felt that they needed more knowledge of their own faith and more space to develop themselves before they could engage with people of other faiths.

As well as people's different interpretations and practice of faith within a particular religion, the significance of 'faith' to their own identity also varies. For some, faith is in the foreground, for others the background. For some it is adequate and appropriate as an organising framework for developing relationships with others, but this is far from universal.

Deepening the contact

When bridging between people of different backgrounds and interests, generating contact is a primary consideration. Contact is necessary for relationships to grow. In this study a useful categorisation was the basis for evaluating relationship-building. A suggested fourfold model (Mir, forthcoming) distinguishes between four types of power relationship. These might all be described as 'bridging', yet they represent very different dynamics of cohesion and equality:

1. Hospitality – the host and the guest.

2. Information gathering and awareness-raising.

3. 'Real' meeting and developing understanding.

4. Meeting as equals.

At the first level the relationship is that of host and guest, where power remains with the host. In the second and third, increasing levels of information and understanding are created. Hopefully, trust is also strengthened. It is at the fourth level that trust allows open acknowledgement of tensions, and conflicts become possible. Where they can be explored, perceptions can be changed or differences accepted.

Muslim women and their aspirations: summary findings

These two projects challenged negative stereotypes of Muslim women and issues surrounding their relationships with others, across boundaries of faith and culture.

- The lives of Muslim women in Bradford are diverse. Many younger women are expressing their opinions and living their lives to promote real transformation in their family and city.

- These women have aspirations that mirror those of other groups in society. They want to live full and productive lives and challenge violence, oppression and exclusion, whether in Bradford or in the Middle East.

- These women condemn the domestic violence, forced marriages and other oppressions practised in some families. Their condemnation is grounded in their faith.

- While faith is an important motivator, including the desire to relate well to those of other faiths, a wide variety of belief and practice is observable among these women.

- More sophisticated understanding is needed of the personal contact required for bridging between communities, based on the 'journey' necessary for women to trust each other and to address conflicts and tensions positively.

- Significant barriers inhibit bridging. Bonding and bridging within the faith community is often needed. Reluctance to reach out to others is created by a feeling of inadequate knowledge of one's own faith. Bridging is difficult without existing organisational structures to aid contact and credibility. An external facilitator is helpful to bring people together.

Mentoring British Pakistani Muslim young men

> … then I became trusting of them, yeah, actually they have my interest. They tell me, "yeah, you can do this". So that's where in the early stages when I started to see them as mentors, because they did those things for me, printing at no cost. In my eyes they were trustworthy. They were credible. They walk the talk so to speak. They didn't just use words to inspire me, like "get an education". They actually sacrificed bits of their time, their money and stuff. That's when I started seeing them as mentors. (Past user of WBYI; Gill, 2008)

West Bowling Youth Initiative

This project provides a unique and detailed insight into the philosophy and operations of a voluntary scheme working with young men of British Pakistani Muslim heritage in a small district of Bradford. West Bowling Youth Initiative (WBYI) was established in the early 1990s with a local management committee and local youth workers.

Building trusting relationships

WBYI emphasises the importance of building trusting relationships with the young men and their families. It has developed training programmes in citizenship, sports and travel activity, and breathed new life into Bowling Old Lane Cricket Club. The project office has become the place for youngsters to drop in; the 'hub' is the place where conversations take place and friendships are built.

West Bowling, an inner-city district of terraced housing built at the start of the twentieth century, is to the south of Bradford city centre and has a majority Pakistani Muslim population. In 2001 the Government created the Trident New Deal for Communities agency with a £50 million budget to be invested over ten years in the renewal of this and adjacent neighbourhoods. WBYI lived through the Bradford riots of 1995 and July 2001, although most of the violence was in Manningham, to the north of the city centre.

Discontented young men: behaviour, territory and the future

In considering Bradford's situation in 2007, practitioners contemplated the city's vulnerability to fresh disturbances and identified a number of worrying conditions:

> Chief among these was a concern over the high levels of discontent expressed by young people … the relatively low levels of educational achievement and engagement, high levels of crime that young people can get 'sucked into' and the low level of mixing between young people from different ethnic groupings were all seen as underlying factors which could lead to fresh disturbances. Added to this were serious concerns about racism, a lack of equal opportunities and pressures on particular communities from the press and police. (Pearson, 2007, p.3)

The WBYI project has helped the growth and mature development of young men who are able to contribute to cohesive communities.

The focus of this concern about discontented young people has, over the years, been British-born Pakistani Muslim young men. Following the violence of 2001 their economic status and social position have been analysed, their multiple identities investigated in relation to Islam, gender and sense of citizenship, and their 'street culture' scrutinised (Macey, 2005). The dangers of generalisation and stereotyping abound (Ramji, 2007).

Territoriality is significant for self-identity and formative in the behaviours of young people in UK cities, including Bradford (Kintrea *et al.*, 2008). Many factors contribute to young people's participation in territorial behaviour. It can be a source of friendship and group solidarity, gaining respect among peers, as well as perceived ownership and protection of girls and young women in an area. Ritualised gang fighting and criminal activity complete the picture. This gives an indication of what life is like for many of the young Muslims WBYI works with.

Another insight into the lives of young Muslim men was detailed in an earlier Bradford study (Alam and Husband, 2006). This concluded that "while there was some generational continuity of cultural values and norms, significant changes also appeared to be taking place." The authors reflected on the experience of these young men living in the city, in the following terms:

- Of the 25 participants, most considered themselves as British and felt that, despite seeing racism, poverty and other structural inequalities, they had a positive outlook on living in the multicultural city.

- For them, although varying in religious practice, Islam was an important facet of spiritual, economic, moral and political life.

- Many worked for themselves and saw economic activity as an extension of family and community responsibility. Many grew up in situations where a significant proportion of household income was sent to Pakistan, either for financial support or to develop properties and homes.

- They identified illegal drugs activity as one of the most distressing aspects of life in some areas, seen as a career choice for a few younger men.

WBYI: approach and operations

The approach adopted over the years by WBYI deserves recognition. It makes no excuse about prioritising work with young men of Pakistani Muslim heritage, while being inclusive of others who choose involvement. Of course, this 'group' is not homogeneous. Age and family origin vary; some are Mirpuri, others Kashmiri; some take religious practice seriously, others are nominal in their belief.

These young people face issues that, while not exclusive to Muslim communities, nevertheless have a particular expression that makes them more difficult to combat. They might come from stable family backgrounds and yet have issues they are reluctant to articulate. These might relate to school and education, gender issues, and more general unease about future life prospects. Issues of domestic violence, family breakdown and arranged marriages surface on occasion, but matters of mental health, drug and alcohol abuse are not uncommon. How do the workers at WBYI set about their task? What principles do they attempt to follow?

- They create a sense of belonging and encourage participation in the local community. Active citizenship is the route.

- They recognise the backgrounds from which the young people come. They understand the pressures and expectations of the community, while not over-emphasising the role of faith.

- Local workers provide 'role models' and active mentors. This has allowed long-term relationships to develop, but without undermining the sense of responsibility that young people must learn for themselves.

- This long-term commitment builds trust locally among other, non-Pakistani Muslim people. Effective partnerships with long-standing members of the Bowling Old Lane Cricket Club and the MAPA youth centre (Margaret McMillan Adventure Playground Association, which caters for young people of more mixed backgrounds) are examples.

CASE STUDY: Buddi's story

Background

Buddi is local to West Bowling and had become involved in criminal activity, influenced by his peer group. He approached WBYI for support.

WBYI project intervention

Buddi began to participate in voluntary activities under the supervision of the WBYI project worker, who was well respected in the local community and by Buddi's parents. The same project worker represented Buddi in court, which made a huge difference in his life. Buddi described having a good relationship with the project worker as fundamental:

> "I think it boils down to having a good relationship with that person, who can be your role model and you could trust as well. My trust with [project worker] was when he stood up in court for me, that said it all for me. There was no one out there to do that. He did a character reference and quoted everything he supervised me on, on my development, on me changing, in front of the judge's eyes."

Through this intensive support and project work, Buddi developed an interest in youth and community work. Voluntary work organised through the project helped to improve his confidence and he became active in organising events and activities himself. He also participated in international youth exchanges, where he represented local young people and spoke to funding organisations. He decided that he wanted to "make a difference" in young people's lives and "keep them off the streets", which has shaped his future career choices. However, Buddi also described how it remained hard to avoid offending, as many of his peers were still engaged in criminal activity: "I was hanging around with a lot of criminals, shall I say, and it was hard for me to pull away ... it was a vicious circle ... but if they got involved in criminal activity, I walked away".

Outcomes

Buddi now works with young people with similar experiences and has returned to education as a mature student. With the help of WBYI, Buddi has developed other interests, particularly in relation to working with young people. WBYI provided the platform to build social capital, in terms of opportunities and social networks, that led to a greater sense of commitment to community (Gill, 2008).

Challenges

This project has helped in the growth and mature development of young men who are then able to contribute to cohesive, sustainable communities. But it has felt under threat by moves (since revised) to target government funding away from those working with single (ethnic) groups. There is a role for work with people of one culture and gender. Consistent, long-term local presence is paramount to success; only on that basis will trusting relationships develop – a necessary basis for responding to issues that arise at times.

Government policy on 'preventing violent extremism' has presented another major challenge to the WBYI leaders. They decided not to apply for funding under this policy because of the 'blame the Muslims' message perceived to be attached to it.

There are also always difficulties in reaching those young men who 'need to be reached' and who have so far stayed away – those involved in illegal activities in particular. Alcohol abuse, drug trafficking, issues of gender relations and extremism are present, as in non-Muslim communities. Mentoring and the WBYI approach show how these issues could be tackled.

British Pakistani Muslim young men: summary findings

This project working alongside young men in West Bowling demonstrates important principles that need to be heard more widely.

- Most Muslim young men in West Bowling are not involved with extremism or illegal drugs activity – stereotypes are challenged through the WBYI project. But they experience additional pressures from their Pakistani Muslim heritage. Issues of 'territory' common to young men are heightened because of differing ethnicity in adjacent neighbourhoods. Gender relations take on particular forms because of male/female roles in many Muslim families. The low educational achievement of previous generations tends towards the stigmatisation of present generations. The contrast between poverty, generated by low-wage employment, and conspicuous affluence made possible by life 'outside the law' raises questions for young people.

- The key to this youth work is the development of trusting relationships, between youth workers and young men, and also with their families and local Muslim communities.

- Relationships of trust are created by youth workers who grew up in West Bowling and are thoroughly part of that community. Long-term relationships mean that they become more effective role models and engage in consistent mentoring.

- Although working with one group of people, WYBI's long-term commitment provides the platform for strong local relationships with other agencies and groups.

- The approach to mentoring is founded on encouraging active citizenship developed through a sense of belonging to the community and neighbourhood.

- Challenges for WBYI come from various directions. Any long-term project has to constantly renew itself and its approach and consider the next generation of young people and staff. There are challenges regarding those not involved with WBYI, those who are involved in illegal activity and those on the fringes of extremism. And how should the project respond to government policy, such as the 'prevent violent extremism' agenda, which is perceived to be counter-productive and stigmatising?

The experience of recent migrants to Bradford

> I'd like to meet more locals – fit in more. Even if we start going to the [Community Council] meetings, we can start filtering in. That's the next step. Instead of being reclusive, we need someone to whom we can say 'help!'. (Resident of Holme Wood; Orton, 2008).

Migrants from Africa and Eastern Europe

Two JRF research and development projects explored the experiences of new migrants to Bradford. The *Holme Wood development project* worked with a small number of recent migrants from Nigeria, France, the Congo, Burundi and Zimbabwe who had moved onto the 'traditionally white' social housing estate of Holme Wood, to the south of the city. The *Making a new life* project investigated the settlement of East European migrants, many of them from Poland, who live across the district but predominantly in the inner city.

Throughout the last decade there has been growing research interest in the changing patterns of migration to the UK. Initially concerns were articulated about the number of asylum seekers arriving in the country and how their needs could be assessed and met in a way that was fair to settled residents. From 2004 onwards, with the expansion of the European Union by the accession of eight East European (A8) countries, followed by Bulgaria and Romania in 2007, the unexpected nature of the large-scale immigration from these countries triggered research to contribute to the development of understanding and policy.

A major difficulty is the lack of accurate information about the level of migration, including numbers, status, location and migrants' economic circumstances (Perry, 2008; Blake *et al.*, 2008). Recent studies reveal a number of issues faced by new migrants, including:

- uncertainties about immigration status;
- lack of advice;
- language barriers;
- frequent changes in accommodation;
- poor housing conditions;
- poor access to wider services.

Evidence suggests that new immigrants are making a positive contribution to the economy and to the cultural and social fabric of towns and neighbourhoods. Yet it also suggests that they typically "live in poor quality housing in deprived inner-city neighbourhoods, with many facing harassment and hostility and experiencing difficulties in accessing appropriate support" (Robinson and Reeve, 2006). These difficulties can be exacerbated if the migrant is not joining family and friends who provide an established community giving support and advice; isolation is the result (Jayaweera and Choudhury, 2008).

Isolation and the reality of 'disconnection'

The findings of the *Holme Wood development project* provide further evidence about the isolation and 'disconnection' described by new migrants to the estate. Many of the new residents (both black and white) who engaged with the project have their roots in Africa. Identifying and contacting them proved difficult, an indication of this isolation. Some of them said that they had positive experiences of moving to Holme Wood, but others experienced harassment and consequent distress. Some families reported a difficult start followed by a period of adaptation and a growing sense of attachment to the area.

Their problems were usually caused by young people, often under the age of 14, who, it was reported, saw new families as vulnerable and easy targets. The migrants interviewed interpreted this as part of a wider problem of anti-social behaviour also affecting other residents.

> In many ways the issues faced by new residents have been about learning to cope with many of the problems that other residents face in the same way, albeit accentuated by coming to terms with a very different social setting. (Illingworth, 2008)

There was a reported unwillingness to report such behaviour, and the new migrants tended to "keep their heads down".

Intervention and support

The study concluded that intervention and support are needed in the early stages of residency, before irretrievable detachment and resentment towards the area are established. Building mutual self-help is a good objective, but effort is needed to encourage the creation of networks between established residents and relative newcomers (Orton, 2008).

Unfortunately, this is not the full story. Professionals working with people on the estate reported that:

> … there is evidently greater hostility shown towards those of South Asian background, and those who have similar features and appearance. (Illingworth, 2008)

Contact networks

The *Making a new life* project investigated the experience of a different set of migrants, from East European EU countries. It concluded that many had an experience in common with those who had migrated from the Indian sub-continent in earlier decades. Escaping poverty, finding work and making a better life are the drivers for migration. The immigration process is encouraged and affected by the presence of extended family members and others from the same originating communities. Finding somewhere to live and a job is aided by such contacts and support networks. One Polish migrant talked of "repairing BMWs, Jaguars, all models in a new place, a big place, working with maybe 20 people from Poland".

CASE STUDY: Polish entrepreneur (Male, early 30s, single)

Background

The interviewee had moved to the UK over three years earlier from Warsaw in Poland. He came straight to Bradford because that was where he found his first job. As a migrant worker he left behind in Poland his girlfriend and parents, hoping to raise sufficient funds to bring his future bride over to the UK and to settle down permanently in England, though he does not know if he will remain in Bradford. His English is quite fluent now, although he studied part-time to improve his speaking and writing skills.

> "At first it was difficult to understand people in Bradford. There are many accents here, and it is not easy to understand what is said, especially by phone."

Experiences

Before travelling to the UK he was interviewed by an employment agency, which was seeking workers for various positions in the UK and which found him a job in Bradford. The work was fairly low-skilled, but it gave him a starting point and income to set up home and make savings for his future plans.

> "I remember when I first came to the UK. I didn't recognise any of the products in the shops. There is a fairly large population of Polish people in Bradford, so why not bring Polish products over here?"

Seeing a gap in the market, he opened a bank account and set up his own firm selling imported Polish food and drink. As a businessman he had to find out most of the information he needed for his business by asking questions. In this way he made contact with a wide cross-section of people in Bradford and across the region. The process also helped to improve his speaking and writing skills, and with this his confidence also improved.

> "Working your way through bureaucratic forms to set up a business is very complicated. I had very little support, and I had to teach myself, often by learning from mistakes. If I had to repeat my time over again I would make more preparations before coming to the UK. I am not used to all the regulations and laws which control businesses over here. In Poland it is so much easier."

Cultural diversity

Although this interviewee understood the importance of culture, especially in a large city such as Bradford where a great number of minority ethnic groups live alongside each other, many migrants are patriotic and protective of their own cultural features.

> "We don't know much about Pakistanis and Indians and their food and music in Poland. There are some benefits – each country brings its own culture, and we should take advantage of each group's distinctive features." (QED, 2009)

Interestingly, the study discovered that there seems to be little relationship between these recent migrants from Poland and those of the 1940s and 1950s or their descendents.

> In fact, there appeared to be outright hostility in the settled Polish community, which was reciprocated by the new immigrants, who felt that the older population had distanced themselves from their roots and did not approve the direction that their mother country had taken.
> (QED, 2009)

The experience of migration reported in other research is an appropriate description of the situation in Bradford. Spoken and written English is crucial; finding relevant jobs and accessing decent accommodation are priorities. Many of those interviewed had neighbours of differing backgrounds and cultures, including those of Pakistani or Bangladeshi origin. Relationships were generally seen as positive, both in the neighbourhood and more widely.

Nevertheless, there were negative stories:

> A Slovakian man was robbed outside a nightclub by Asian youths. He said that the police were great when he reported them. He saw it as his own fault – he had drunk too much and should have been more aware. The youths thought he was English.
> (QED, 2009)

The study noted that despite incidents of varying degrees, there was no sign of persistent threats: "Overall, we found few signs of a community under pressure. On the contrary, the people we met seemed to be adopting very normal patterns of socialisation" (QED, 2009). In a complementary survey of over 20 Polish migrants in August 2008, the deteriorating economic situation was significant in making many think of returning home to Poland.

Recent migrants to Bradford: summary findings

The experience of moving to Bradford was investigated in two projects. One listened to the views of a small group of migrants from African countries, while the other worked with migrants from Eastern Europe.

- Migrants from Africa who participated in the study were housed on a 'traditionally white' housing estate. Most had no contacts in the city when they arrived and so experienced considerable isolation, with meagre support and little sense of welcome from neighbours. Even finding people willing to engage in the research was problematic.
- Most indicated that, with time, they were starting to adapt and feel at home, but this came after a difficult start. Much initial grief was due to youngsters who saw newcomers as an easy target for anti-social behaviour.
- Intervention and support are needed from social housing officers and other agencies in the early stages of residency, before detachment and resentment become established.
- Migrants from Eastern Europe were more likely to find accommodation in private rented housing. After initial arrivals had settled, networks of contact through family and friends were available for them to use, easing the settling-in process of finding jobs, housing and improving English language skills. There was little evidence of a community under pressure.
- Recent migrants were seen to have little positive relationship with the descendents of those from Poland and Eastern Europe who stayed after the Second World War. Interviews revealed suspicion on both sides.

The views of residents of ‘traditionally white’ estates

> Personally what I’ve experienced living here for 20 years is that there is true ignorance of diversity and when they are racist, it’s just because they don’t know any better.”
> (Local community worker; Orton, 2008).

This combination of factors provided the context for a study of community participation on three estates: Scholemoor in Bradford, and Braithwaite and Guardhouse in Keighley. The study used community activists as ‘community researchers’ to work with local residents to develop their own solutions to the issues on the estates. It encouraged critical self-reflection using visual media (video, film and photography) to engage with and think through the issues.

Encouraging critical reflection

In discussions about community cohesion and the impact of migration in the UK, concern has been growing to better understand the attitudes and aspirations of settled white working-class people, especially those living on out-of-town council estates. The voice of those promoting far-right views and espousing policies with their roots in racism, xenophobia and Islamophobia is recognised in Bradford. The needs of those living in social housing on peripheral housing estates are often the result of poverty, family breakdown and reliance on financial support from the state. Inequality and class divisions lie at the heart of these issues (Sveinsson, 2009).

Deep-seated disempowerment

The project focused on what residents thought about their estates, themselves and contacts with local agencies. Assumptions about estate homogeneity were challenged: Scholemoor is no longer all ‘white’ as there are Slovakian and Roma residents as well as 100 Asian British households. Overall, residents said that they felt a deep-seated disempowerment in many areas of their lives. For many indigenous people, this stemmed from bad experiences at school, amplified by unemployment, lack of respect from others and a feeling that nothing changes, despite what is said. Frustration and resentment could lead to an acceptance that ‘it’s my own fault’, when they know it is not.

Many residents do more than survive: they have a sense of pride, dignity and achievement, often expressed through family, solidarity with friends and neighbours and local bonding in the face of external threats.

A study by the National Community Forum on the *Sources of resentment and perceptions of ethnic minorities among poor white people in England* (Garner *et al*., 2009) gives another dimension. It concludes that local conditions are significant framing factors for any relationship between groups of people. A self-identity which stresses 'working class' and a life experience characterised by inequality generates among the white majority an assumed role "as the victim" (Garner *et al*., 2009, p.9).

This "estatism" (as one community researcher described it) develops from a clear awareness of inequality which deeply affects the sense of the self and often contributes to ill-health. Yet many residents do more than survive: they have a sense of pride, dignity and achievement, often expressed through family, solidarity with friends and neighbours and local bonding in the face of external threats. These social and territorial boundaries are often hidden from outsiders.

Estate residents and their issues

There is a significant level of intergenerational misunderstanding and suspicion. Many older residents fear younger ones, and just want to feel safe in their homes and neighbourhood. Young people struggle with the mismatch between their aspirations and poverty, lack of opportunity and peer pressures. For girls and young women there is the expectation of early sexual activity, and possible grooming and attempted rape, despite these being taboo subjects.

A second issue concerns relationships between local people and the various agencies that work on the estate.

> When we were growing up as kids, we learnt to be afraid of agencies. 'Cos if you saw the police they were dragging people away. If you saw social services you were told to keep your mouth shut or you'd get taken away. They need to get out there, build relationships.
> (Female resident, Scholemoor)

Communication with agencies is often poor, relationships can be too formal and written communications can depend on a level of literacy which is not always present – and often invisible, hidden by people's sense of shame. Despite the involvement of several hard-working and committed professionals, trust is easily lost and hard to recover when issues are not sorted out or when hard decisions result in anger and frustration.

The study concluded that "not all problems can be solved on the estates", as poverty and inequality, education, employment and healthcare are society-wide issues. But mindsets can change. Believing that local residents know best and have the capacity to contribute to solving their own problems is a major start. Service deliverers need the encouragement and space to build rapport and trust; this is about respect and relationship-building more than anything else.

One theme explored through interviews with stakeholders from housing and other social care agencies working in Holme Wood was its reputation as a 'racist' estate. This reputation has been fed by stories about South Asian families who have left the estate because of harassment and vandalism. In addition, it has been reported that:

> There is a very real problem for residents living in the area who need to use a taxi. Many Asian taxi drivers and their firms are unwilling to travel into the estate at night or at all for fear of attack.
> (Illingworth, 2008)

It is unclear how much an isolated incident may have triggered a more widespread set of fears and myths. It seems that such attitudes are reserved for those of Pakistani origin rather than other ethnicities.

Young people and their sense of territory

A study of young people and territoriality in British cities (Kintrea *et al.*, 2008) concluded that: "territoriality was part of everyday life for young people in the six cities studied", including Bradford. The Holme Wood research (Illingworth, 2008) identified this territoriality in three different ways. First, it appeared to be part of the relationship between this largely white estate and adjacent inner-city areas, where the majority population are of Pakistani Muslim origin:

> Animosities and misconceptions exist on this level much more than any tension with other minorities actually living on the estate.
> (Illingworth, 2008)

Secondly, stakeholders acknowledged that some young people see particular areas within the estate as their territory. In the film *Voices from Holme Wood* (JRF, 2008) young people commented on the importance of being identified with either the 'top end' or the 'bottom end' of the estate, while older residents, also directly affected, remarked that this divide has been present for decades. Thirdly, there are tensions between young people living in Holme Wood and the neighbouring former council estate of Bierley, another 'traditionally white' estate.

Holme Wood Neighbourhood Element Survey

These observations on Holme Wood need to be set within the context provided by other local studies. Bradford council sponsored a 'Neighbourhood Element Survey' in April 2008 (Maydew and Handley, 2008), asking questions of a sample of residents about their estate. Half of the 199 respondents identified 'activities for teenagers' and 'clean streets' as their top priorities for improving their local neighbourhood. Some 80 per cent agreed with the statement that 'overall my neighbourhood is a good place to live', while 10 per cent disagreed; 20 per cent thought the area was improving, 14 per cent deteriorating.

Some 70 per cent of people felt that 'this local area is a place where people from different backgrounds get on well together', although 8 per cent disagreed. The nature of this predominantly white estate was shown by 14 per cent of respondents agreeing with the statement that 'there are no residents from other backgrounds' in their neighbourhood. Over 80 per cent of the respondents in Holme Wood said that they had not participated in any community activity over the previous twelve months; a similar proportion felt that they had little or no influence over decisions affecting their local area.

Residents of 'white' estates and their views: summary findings

Residents of four former council estates participated in two projects to explore their views about themselves and the issues they face. Public debate about ethnic minorities and spatial segregation has recently shifted focus onto the views of ethnic majorities on social housing estates, often with an emphasis on their 'whiteness'. Some have argued that this emphasis on 'colour' is inappropriate and that issues of poverty and inequality are the most important factors in developing arguments which give little value to racist politics.

- The studies confirmed widespread, deep-seated disempowerment felt by a large proportion of residents. Lack of respect between people on the estate and 'outsiders', together with the sense that nothing ever changes, leads residents to accept that 'it must be our own fault'.

- Nevertheless, many residents understood that the issues they face are society-wide and that solutions are not to be found on the estate alone. Inequality, poor education, lack of employment and poor access to healthcare are bigger issues which they cannot control directly, but about which they certainly have views.

- Within the estates one of the most significant problems is relationships between old and young. Older people are fearful of teenagers and children. Younger people get frustrated because of the lack of 'things to do' that they can afford, and they willingly respond to peer pressure. The reality of unfulfilled aspirations contributes to anti-social behaviour, drug and alcohol abuse and early sexual activity.

- Relationships between local residents and the professional agencies they have to deal with are often poor, notwithstanding the hard work and commitment of several professionals. Residents' suspicion of the social landlord, the police and social services is matched by poor communication by these agencies. Face-to-face contact may be limited; relationships can be overly formal and depend on a level of resident literacy that is often absent.

- Evidence from one estate, Scholemoor, suggests that it is possible and desirable to move towards a greater variety of people of different backgrounds living as neighbours. Agency support and good, on-the-ground relationships are required, together with quick and appropriate action as and when tension arises.

- Territoriality is part of everyday life for many people on these estates. This is not a new phenomenon. Their experience of the wider city and region might be limited, so 'owning their space' is an important part of their identity. This is expressed within the estate, between neighbouring working-class estates (such as Holme Wood and Bierley) or between the traditionally white estates and predominantly Pakistani Muslim districts (such as Manningham or West Bowling). Mutual threats, the occasional dispute and racist attitudes and behaviour thrive in such situations.

Using creative media

> As mechanisms for change, arts programmes are flexible, responsive to local need and circumstance, and highly cost effective. Their potential to create imaginative solutions and to change perceptions is exceptional.
> (JRF, 1996)

In the mid-1990s, the research centre Comedia undertook a study of the social impact of arts programmes. It concluded that there were extensive benefits for personal development, social cohesion, community empowerment, identity and health and well-being (Matarasso, 1997), a point re-emphasised by experience in Slough (Wilkinson *et al*., 2003).

The creative arts' potential to deliver relevant regeneration and community renewal led JRF to produce a video, *Culture makes communities* (JRF, 1998), featuring six projects from the north of England that demonstrated how arts projects could lead to significant energising of communities. This thinking has been developed through the research and development projects in Bradford. The notion that the creative arts have the potential to play a "significant role in the delivery of other agendas" (Shafi, 2005) was a central assumption of the Bradford programme.

The range of creative media

Seven of the Bradford projects implemented in 2006–2009 used creative arts to some extent in their research and development work. In some they provided the vehicle for delivering development activity. In others they were research tools, and in many projects they communicated important outputs alongside more traditional written reports. Of special importance are the films produced and widely circulated, as DVDs and through websites, communicating the content of the projects and the learning from them.

The following creative arts were used:

- craftwork, dance, drama, music and film to encourage healthy living (*Engage*);
- mobile phone photography, local festival and film-making (*West Bowling Youth Initiative*);
- drama and film (*Keighley now*);
- film (*Holme Wood development project*);
- film and websites (*Women working towards excellence*);
- 'mela', an intercultural festival stemming from Asian roots (*Making a new life*);
- photography and films (*Participation and community on Bradford's 'traditionally white' estates*).

The experience of wide-ranging use of the creative arts in research and development projects has provided some lessons, both positive and negative.

Selecting creative media

Care is needed in selecting which 'creative art' should be used in a particular situation. If the project's aims are to encourage transformation in attitudes and behaviour, it is important that those participating are thoroughly involved in decisions about the art form to use. Appropriate art forms are needed for each context, and barriers are created by making assumptions about people's interests. For example, an initial proposal to engage the young men of West Bowling in a photography project ran into considerable apathy. Most were more interested in cricket. It was only when it was suggested that mobile phones be used that they were motivated to 'click'. The photos captured through the *Mobile memories* project formed the basis for an exhibition, *Peacocks in West Bowling*, which attracted nearly 3,000 visitors in a month.

The *Engage* 'healthy living' project discussed preferences with each participating group. The Bangladeshi women were interested in textiles and craft activity. The new mothers wanted dance and exercise. The Chattitude Youth Group preferred dance and rap. The Dominican seniors group sewed and took digital photographs. The project concluded that:

> It was evident that the activities facilitated a sense of well-being. The groups tended to underestimate their abilities to successfully complete tasks, but all displayed a sense of pride in their achievement.
> (Baylin, 2008)

Most participants in the programme had good levels of health awareness, but they experienced barriers to lifestyle change. The confidence built up through working creatively within their groups enabled these barriers to be addressed.

Community events

The *Communities Bradford* projects have provided examples of community events organised to bring people of different backgrounds and cultures together. Bringing people into contact with others in a relaxed, enjoyable environment provides opportunities for them to get to know and understand each other more fully and helps to break down barriers. Various factors are important to the success of such events, including a clear aim, strong local networks committed to making them happen and choosing the most appropriate activities, location and times.

The community youth festival organised by the West Bowling Youth Initiative and the international dinner and the football 'mela' organised by QED illustrate these principles. In West Bowling, the festival was developed in partnership with Trident New Deal for Communities, local organisations and local people. It was supported by volunteers, local partners, past workers and the young people themselves (Gill, 2008). On a warm summer's day around 600 people came to see a variety of local bands and to meet.

> See, in a lot of photos, there are a lot of people together, riding bikes, talking, playing basketball, football, on the stalls. I thought, "take a picture of people you wouldn't normally see together, walking down the street, talking, chit chatting; white and Asian, black and Asian, the Slovakians, everything".
> (Young person; Gill, 2008)

The purpose of the festival was clear and networks already existed to make the event a reality.

The QED 'Unity in diversity' international buffet dinner was targeted at minority ethnic communities in the five inner-city wards. Food, speeches and performances of music and dance from seven different groups brought invited guests together. Over 80 per cent said that they appreciated the opportunity to meet people from diverse backgrounds and celebrate their cultures.

However, "The community football match and mela event was less well attended" (QED, 2009). It failed to attract people from across the city and the majority of those attending "came for the football". Questions about clarity of purpose, publicity, promotion and lack of awareness of competing events were asked later on.

Film-making

Many projects used film-making to develop their aims. *For Women working towards excellence*, film-making was central, as it was for the project on *Participation and community on Bradford's 'traditionally white' estates.* The films made through the *West Bowling Youth Initiative*, the *Holme Wood development project* and *Engage* focused more on communicating outcomes. Recognising the different purposes of filming is fundamental. If the aim is to communicate completed project work, then arranging to introduce film expertise once the project is nearing completion could be enough. If, however, the filming activity and its processes are central to achieving the project's objectives, this must be integrated from the start.

The *Women working towards excellence* project placed film-making at the centre of its strategy.

> Ten Muslim women were given the opportunity to learn from and work with professional film-makers, producers, directors, photographers and artists … the participatory videos process is a crucial way of bringing people together to explore issues, voice concerns or simply to be creative and tell stories, build confidence, acquire new skills and articulate concerns, with the process being more important than the visual outcome. (Shaffi, forthcoming)

A film screening night at the National Media Museum in Bradford in November 2008 launched the films to an audience of 250 people. Such achievement came about through dedicated leaders who could facilitate and encourage. Creativity, application and perseverance produced powerful films, challenging stereotypical views of Muslim women.

Film-making requires careful preparation and attention to detail. It cannot assume the continued participation of local people. Clear expectations about what is involved and quality control over the processes used should mitigate risks of participants' withdrawal, as experienced by one of the projects.

Using creative media: summary findings

Seven projects made some use of creative media, for a variety of purposes: delivering development aspects, as research tools encouraging participants to express their views and opinions and, finally, as a major means of communicating the outputs from the research and development 'to get the message across'.

- Choosing the appropriate art form for working with participants is crucial. Discussing past experience and skills they want to develop is an essential starting point to generate commitment and the potential for achieving objectives.
- Community events are important in celebrating and challenging people of differing backgrounds to accept and learn from each other. Clear aims, good collective leadership and solid local networks of committed people are vital to success.
- Film-making played an important role in many of the projects. The key is to decide the role that film-making is to play in a project. Is it to be a core activity, a research tool or a means of communicating outputs? It could be all three.
- Willing participants in film-making should have ultimate control, with professional advisers, about what should be shot and shown. Careful preparation, an eye for detail and good quality control are required.

Conclusion

The Joseph Rowntree Foundation's *Communities Bradford* programme supported eight research and development projects from 2006–2009. The programme focused on Muslim women, Pakistani Muslim young men, recent migrants to the city, life on former council estates and the use of creative media. The evidence from these projects provides key messages for national and local policy-makers.

The hundreds of people living in Bradford whose voices were heard through these projects experience at first hand the challenges faced by the city: poverty, disempowerment, social and economic division, racism and, now, the additional impacts of recession. But many also expressed great pride in Bradford, and their lives showed dignity, resilience, activism and hope.

Harnessing that pride and activism to create a more equal and cohesive Bradford is a key challenge for the local authority and partners. However, as the evidence also implies, national policies and frameworks on cohesion may be hindering rather than helping.

JRF research

Baylin, E. (2008) *Engage* [Unpublished]

Cowan, M. (2008) *Keighley now* [Unpublished]

Gill, S.S. (2008) *Lessons from West Bowling Youth Initiative: Then, now and the future*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Illingworth, H. (2008) *Findings from the Holme Wood development project 2007/08: Demographic changes and effects.* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Pearce, J. (forthcoming) *Participation and community on Bradford's 'traditionally white' estates.* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Mir, G. (forthcoming) *Women, faith and social cohesion: Models for evaluating social and civic relationships.* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Orton, A. (2008) *Evaluating cross-community work in Holme Wood: Making connections?* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

QED (2009) *Making a new life: Report of a research project on the settlement of East European migrants in Bradford* [Unpublished]

Shaffi, W. (forthcoming) *Women working towards excellence/ OurLives: Muslim women in Bradford.* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Communities Bradford films, 2008 (available at www.jrf.org.uk/bradford)

Women working towards excellence: Films from the OurLives project.

- *Riffat: Traditions in a changing society*
- *Mumtaz: In our defence*
- *Saiqa: Driving out stereotypes*
- *In My Name: A collection of Muslim women's voices*
- *Syima*
- *One day in May*
- *The making of Our Lives*
- *Shirin Ebadi interview*

The West Bowling Youth Initiative

- *Then, now and the future (WBYI)*
- *In My Name: A collection of Muslim men's voices*

Holme Wood development project

- *Voices from Holme Wood*

References

Alam, M.Y. (Ed.) (2007) *Made in Bradford*. Pontefract: Route Books.

Alam, M.Y. & Husband, C. (2006) *British-Pakistani men from Bradford: Linking Narratives to Policy.* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Blake, G. *et al*. (2008) *Community Engagement and Community Cohesion.* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Carling, A. (2008) 'The Curious Case of the Mis-claimed Myth Claims: Ethnic Segregation, Polarisation and the Future of Bradford' in *Urban Studies* 45(30) 553-589, March.

Darlow, A. *et al.* (2005) *Researching Bradford: a review of social research on Bradford District.* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Furbey, R, *et al.* (2006) *Faith as Social Capital: Connecting or Dividing?* Bristol: Policy Press for the Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Garner, S. *et al*. (2009) *Sources of resentment and perceptions of ethnic minorities among poor white people in England.* London: DCLG for the National Community Forum.

Harries, B., Richardson, L. & Soteri-Proctor, (2008) *Housing Aspirations for a New Generation: Perspectives from White and South Asian British Women.* Coventry: Chartered Institute of Housing for the Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

House of Commons Select Committee on Home Affairs (2008) *Domestic Violence, Forced Marriage and 'Honour'–based Violence.* Sixth Report of Session 2007–2008. London: The Stationery Office Ltd.

Jayaweera, H. & Choudhury, T. (2008) *Immigration, Faith and Cohesion: Evidence from Local Areas with Significant Muslim Population.* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Johnston, R., Poulsen, M. & Forrest, J. (2005) 'On the measurement and meaning of residential segregation: a response to Simpson.' *Urban Studies* 42(7) 1221-1227.

Joseph Rowntree Foundation (1996) *The Art of Regeneration: Urban Renewal through Cultural Activity*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Joseph Rowntree Foundation (1998) *Culture makes Communities* (Video and booklet). York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Kintrea, K. *et al*. (2008) *Young People and Territoriality in British Cities*. York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Lewis, P. (2007) *Young, British and Muslim*. London: Continuum.

Macey, M. (2005) *The 2001 Bradford Riot: Some Questions and Answers. End of research report to West Yorkshire Police.* Bradford: Bradford University.

Macey, M. (2008) 'Trans-continental Marriage between British and Pakistani Citizens: Arranged or Forced?' *Pakistan Journal of Women's Studies: Alam-e-Niswan.* 15.2. pp1-28.

Matarasso, F. (1997) *Use or Ornament? The Social Impact of Participation in the Arts*. Stroud: Comedia.

Maydew, S. & Handley, S. (2008) *Research Report: Neighbourhood Element Survey, April 2008*. BMG Research for City of Bradford Metropolitan District Council.

Pearson, M. (2007) *ICPS Working Paper 7. Building Community Interaction in Three Post Industrial and Multi-ethnic Northern 'Cities'*. Bradford: University of Bradford.

Perry, J. (2008) *The Housing and Neighbourhood Impact of Britain's Changing Ethnic Mix.* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Phillips, D., Butt, F. & Davis, C., (2002) 'The Racialisation of Space in Bradford.' *The Regional Review,* 12(2) 9-10.

Rai, S. (2008) *Routes and Barriers to Citizen Governance.* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Ramji, H. (2007) 'Dynamics of Religion and Gender among Young British Muslims.' *Sociology 41(6) 1171-1189 December 2007.*

Robinson, D. & Reeve, K. (2006) *Neighbourhood Experiences of New Immigration: Reflections from the Evidence Base.* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Simpson, L. (2004) 'Statistics of Racial Segregation: measures, evidence and policy.' *Urban Studies,* 41(3) 661-681.

Shafi, F. (2005) *A Summary of Community Arts in Bradford and Ways Forward for the Culture Makes Communities Programme.* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Shafi, F. (2008) *The Bradford Community Guide.* York: Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Shaffi, W. (2009) *Our Stories, Our Lives: Inspiring Muslim Women's Voices*. Bristol: Policy Press for the Joseph Rowntree Foundation.

Sveinsson, K.P. (2009) *Who cares about the White Working Class?* London: Runnymede Trust.

Wilkinson, C. *et al*. (2003) *Art and People: a practical guide to setting up and running arts projects in the community.* Slough: Slough Borough Council.

Published by the Joseph Rowntree Foundation, The Homestead, 40 Water End, York YO30 6WP. This project is part of the JRF's research and development programme. These findings, however, are those of the authors and not necessarily those of the Foundation. ISSN 0958-3084